

## RESEARCH ARTICLE

# Nilpotent Covers of Small Symmetric and Alternating Groups

## NGWAVA ARPHAXAD KIMEU<sup>1</sup>, FREDRICK OLUOCH NYAMWALA<sup>2</sup>, NICK GILL<sup>3</sup> and IAN SHORT<sup>4</sup>

<sup>12</sup>Department of Mathematics, Physics and Computing, Moi University
<sup>34</sup>School of Mathematics and Statistics, The Open University, Milton
Corresponding Author: NICK GILL, E-mail: nick.gill@open.ac.uk

## ABSTRACT

We compute the size of a minimal nilpotent cover for small alternating and symmetric groups, An and Sn. We give precise values for values of n up to 8. For n=9 we give upper and lower bounds for the size of a minimal nilpotent cover of A9.

## **KEYWORDS**

Alternating group; nilpotent cover; symmetric group

## **ARTICLE INFORMATION**

ACCEPTED: 12 April 2025

PUBLISHED: 16 May 2025

**DOI:** 10.32996/jmss.2025.6.2.3

#### 1. Introduction

In this paper we calculate the least number of nilpotent subgroups of the symmetric group on n letters  $S_n$  that are necessary to cover  $S_n$ , for values of n up to and including 9. We also perform similar calculations for the alternating group  $A_n$ .

To explain our results in more detail, consider a finite group *G*. A *nilpotent cover* of *G* is a finite family M of nilpotent subgroups of *G* for which

G = ∪ H . A. *H∈*M

Every finite group *G* has a nilpotent cover comprising the family of cyclic subgroups of *G*. A nilpotent cover M of *G* is said to be *minimal* if no other nilpotent cover of *G* has fewer members. Let  $\Sigma_N(G)$  denote the size of a minimal nilpotent cover of *G*. Notice that if *G* is itself nilpotent, then {*G*} is the unique minimal nilpotent cover of *G* and  $\Sigma_N(G) = 1$ .

When calculating the minimal size of a nilpotent cover, we can immediately restrict our attention to the maximal nilpotent subgroups of *G*. Here a *maximal nilpotent subgroup* of *G* is a subgroup of *G* that is maximal with respect to inclusion in the class of nilpotent subgroups of *G*.

This paper should be seen as a companion to the paper [GKS22] which, as we will see below, gave a formula for  $\Sigma_N(S_n)$ ; on the other hand this same paper showed that the treatment given there did not apply neatly to the groups  $A_n$ .

#### 2. Symmetric groups

Theorem 1.1 of [GKS22] asserts that there is unique minimal cover of  $S_n$  by maximal nilpotent subgroups. In order to give the size of this cover, we define a *distinct partition* of a positive integer *n* to be a set  $T = \{t_1, t_2, ..., t_k\}$ , where  $t_1, t_2, ..., t_k$  are distinct positive integers and  $n = t_1 + t_2 + \cdots + t_k$ . Let us write DP(*n*) for the set of all distinct partitions of *n*. We then have

**Copyright:** © 2025 the Author(s). This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY) 4.0 license (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/). Published by Al-Kindi Centre for Research and Development, London, United Kingdom.

$$\Sigma_N(S_n) = \sum_{T \in \mathrm{DP}(n)} \left( \frac{n!}{\prod_{i \in T} \prod_{i=1}^{\ell} (p_i - 1)^{a_i} p_i^{e_i}} \right)$$

Key words and phrases. alternating group; nilpotent cover; symmetric group.

1

In this expression  $t = p_1^{a_1} p_2^{a_2} \cdots p_{\ell}^{a_{\ell}}$  is the prime factorisation of t (which depends on t) and  $e_i = (p_i^{a_i} - 1)/(p^i - 1)$  for  $i = 1, 2, ..., \ell$ . The product

$$\prod_{i=1}^{\ell} (p_i - 1)^{a_i} p_i^{e_i}$$

is considered to take the value 1 if t = 1. Table 2.1 displays the first few values of DP(n) and  $\Sigma_N(S_n)$ .

n	DP( <i>n</i> )	$\Sigma_N(S_n)$	$\Sigma_N(S_n)$	
	2	{2}	1	
	3	$\{1, 2\}, \{3\}$	4	
	4	$\{1,3\},\{4\}$	7	
	5	$\{1, 4\}, \{2, 3\}, \{5\}$	31	
	6	$\{1, 2, 3\}, \{1, 5\}, \{2, 4\}, \{6\}$	201	
	7	$\{1, 2, 4\}, \{1, 6\}, \{2, 5\}, \{3, 4\}, \{7\}$	1086	
	8	$\{1, 2, 5\}, \{1, 3, 4\}, \{1, 7\}, \{2, 6\}, \{3, 5\}, \{8\}$	5139	
	9	$\{1, 2, 6\}, \{1, 3, 5\}, \{2, 3, 4\}, \{1, 8\}, \{2, 7\}, \{3, 6\}, \{4, 5\}, \{9\}$	37507	

Table 2.1. Values of DP(n) and  $\Sigma_N(S_n)$ , for n = 2, 3, ..., 9.

#### 3. Alternating groups

For the alternating groups, no formula is known for the minimal size of a nilpotent cover. Table 3.1 displays the first few values of  $\Sigma_N(A_n)$ ; these were first calculated in the first author's PhD thesis. We justify the numbers given there below.

n	$\Sigma_N(A_n)$		
2	1		
3	1		
4	5		
5	21		
6	91		
7	666		
8	3571		
9	between	28120 and 30955	
Table 3.1	. Values of $\Sigma_N(A_n)$	), for <i>n</i> = 2,3,,9.	

First, when n = 2 or 3, the group  $A_n$  is itself nilpotent, hence  $\sum_N (A_n) = 1$ . When n = 4, the Sylow subgroups of  $A_n$  are maximal and, because they are pgroups, they nilpotent. What is more, every element of  $A_4$  lies in a unique Sylow subgroup. Thus we just need to count Sylow subgroups of  $A_4$ : there are five in total and the result follows.

3.1. **Cases**  $n \ge 5$ . From here on, the situation is more complicated. We seek to construct a minimal cover, C, of  $G = A_n$  by maximal nilpotent subgroups. Our strategy will be as follows:

- (i) First, we list all conjugacy classses of the group  $G = A_n$ .
- (ii) We enumerate those conjugacy classes,  $C_1$ , for which there exists another class,  $C_2$ , such that elements of  $C_1$  are powers of elements in  $C_2$ . When we are constructing a nilpotent cover it will therefore be sufficient to ensure that all elements of  $C_2$  are contained in an element of the cover, as this will automatically

#### NILPOTENT COVERS OF SMALL SYMMETRIC AND ALTERNATING GROUPS

imply that elements of  $C_1$  are similarly contained.

(iii) Now let g be an element of a conjugacy class that does **not** contain powers of another class. We compute those maximal nilpotent subgroups of G that contain g. In many cases we find that there is only one such maximal nilpotent subgroup,  $N_{q}$  and in that case  $N_{q}$  must be contained in the nilpotent cover, C.

3

(iv) Where there is more than one such maximal nilpotent subgroup, further calculations are required.

Tables 3.2 to 3.6 summarise the situation. The notation we use is as follows:

- (i) Label gives a name for each conjugacy class of  $G = A_n$ ; recall that a conjugacy class in  $A_n$  is determined by cycle type unless that cycle type consists of distinct odd numbers, in which case the class splits in two (so we use labels "a" and "b") and we list the two corresponding conjugacy classes on the same row.
- (ii) *element* gives an element from the conjugacy class(es) on the given row.
- (iii) power of gives a conjugacy class of which the current class is a power, if such exists.
- (iv) subgroup gives the unique maximal nilpotent subgroup N of G that contains a given element from this current class, should such a group exist. Note that we only need to list such groups for classes that do not have an entry in the *power of* column. Our notation here is largely standard; note that  $P_{p,n}$  denotes a Sylow *p*-subgroup of  $A_n$ . In some cases, it turns out that the same group N can be the unique maximal nilpotent subgroup containing elements from more than one conjugacy class (e.g. for class  $Cl_3$  and  $Cl_4$  in  $A_6$ ). In this case we write the subgroup N in parenthesis for one of these classes, to ensure that it is not counted twice; entries after the parenthetic entry will then be empty.
- (v) number gives the number of conjugates of the group N.
- (vi) structure gives the isomorphism class of the group N.

3.2. **Cases** n = 5,6,7. In this case, every single conjugacy class either has an entry in the *power of* column or in the *subgroup* column. As a consequence, the set of all conjugates of groups in the *subgroup* column is a minimal cover of maximal nilpotent subgroups. Hence the size of this cover is given by summing the entries in the *number* column. This yields the values given in Table 3.1.

Note that, in this case, as for n = 3,4,5, there is a unique cover of  $G = A_n$  by maximal nilpotent subgroups. What is more, this cover is a union of conjugacy classes of subgroups (and so is known in the literature as a *normal cover*).

3.3. **Case** n = 8. In this case there is one conjugacy class that has no entry in the *power of* column and in the *subgroup* column, namely the class,  $Cl_8$ , of elements with cycle type 4 – 4. However, in this case, the class,  $Cl_7$ , of elements with cycle type 4 – 2 contains elements which lie in a unique maximal nilpotent subgroup, namely a Sylow 2-subgroup of  $G = A_8$ . Since the union of all the Sylow 2-subgroups contains all elements of cycle type 4 – 4, we find that the listed subgroups already yield a minimal cover of maximal nilpotent subgroups.

22

KIMEU, NYAMWALA, GILL, AND SHORT

Thus, as before, the size of this cover is given by summing the entries in the *number* column. This yields the value 3571 given in Table 3.1. As before, this cover is unique and normal.

3.4 **Case** n = 9. In this case, once again, there is one conjugacy class that has no entry in the *power of* column and in the *subgroup* column, namely the class,  $Cl_{10}$ , of elements with cycle type 4 – 4. This time, though, this class is not contained in the union of subgroups given in the *subgroup* column.

Since the centralizer of an element in  $Cl_{10}$  is a 2-group, a maximal nilpotent subgroup that contains an element of this class must be a Sylow 2-subgroup. The difficulty is that, for any given element g in this class, there are 7 Sylow 2-subgroups containing g.

So a minimal cover of  $A_9$  by maximal nilpotent subgroups must contain the 28120 listed subgroups – the union of these groups contains all conjugacy classes in  $A_9$  apart from  $Cl_{10}$  – as well as some of the 2835 Sylow 2-subgroups of  $A_9$ . We obtain the bounds given in Table 3.1.

Label	element	power of	subgroup	number	structure
$Cl_1$	(1)	All	-	-	
$Cl_2$	(1,2)(3,4)	-	$P_{2,4}$	5	$C_2 \times C_2$
$Cl_3$	(1, 2, 3)	-	$P_{3,3}$	10	$C_3$
$Cl_{4a,4b}$	(1, 2, 3, 4, 5)	-	$P_{5,5}$	6	$C_5$
Total				21	

Table 3.2. Constructing a minimal nilpotent cover of A<sub>5</sub>

Label	element	power of	subgroup	number	structure
$Cl_1$	(1)	All	-	-	-
$Cl_2$	(1, 2)(3, 4)	$Cl_5$	-	-	
$Cl_3$	(1, 2, 3)	-	$(P_{3,6})$	-	-
$Cl_4$	(1, 2, 3)(4, 5, 6)	-	$P_{3,6}$	10	$C_3 \times C_3$
$Cl_5$	(1, 2, 3, 4)(5, 6)	-	$P_{2,6}$	45	$D_8$
$Cl_{6a,6b}$	(1, 2, 3, 4, 5)	-	$P_{5,5}$	36	$C_5$
Total				91	

Table 3.3. Constructing a minimal nilpotent cover of  $A^6$ 

Label	element	power of	subgroup	number	structure
$Cl_1$	(1)	All	-	-	-
$Cl_2$	(1, 2)(3, 4)	$Cl_6$	-	-	-
$Cl_3$	(1, 2, 3)	$Cl_5$	-	-	-
$Cl_4$	(1, 2, 3)(4, 5, 6)	-	$P_{3,6}$	70	$C_3 \times C_3$
$Cl_5$	(1, 2, 3)(4, 5)(6, 7)	-	$P_{2,4} \times P_{3,3}$	35	$C_2 \times C_2 \times C_3$
$Cl_6$	(1, 2, 3, 4)(5, 6)	-	$P_{2,6}$	315	$D_8$
$Cl_7$	(1, 2, 3, 4, 5)	-	$P_{5,5}$	126	$C_5$
$Cl_{8a,8b}$	(1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7)	-	$P_{7,7}$	120	$C_7$
Total				666	

Table 3.4. Constructing a minimal nilpotent cover of A7

Label	element	power of	subgroup	number	structure
$Cl_1$	(1)	All	-	-	-
$Cl_2$	(1, 2)(3, 4)	$Cl_5$	-	-	-
$Cl_3$	(1, 2)(3, 4)(5, 6)(7, 8)	$Cl_8$	-	-	-
$Cl_4$	(1, 2, 3)	$Cl_{10}$	-	-	-
$Cl_5$	(1, 2, 3)(4, 5)(6, 7)	-	$P_{2,4} \times P_{3,3}$	280	$C_3 \times C_2 \times C_2$
$Cl_6$	(1, 2, 3)(4, 5, 6)	$Cl_{11}$	-	-	-
$Cl_7$	(1, 2, 3, 4)(5, 6)	-	$P_{2,8}$	315	$(C_2 \wr C_2) \wr C_2$
$Cl_8$	(1, 2, 3, 4)(5, 6, 7, 8)	-	-	-	-
$Cl_9$	(1, 2, 3, 4, 5)	$Cl_{10}$	-	-	-
$Cl_{10a,10b}$	(1, 2, 3, 4, 5)(6, 7, 8)	-	$P_{5,5} \times P_{3,3}$	336	$C_5 \times C_3$
$Cl_{11}$	(1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6)(7, 8)	-	$C_6$	1680	$C_6$
$Cl_{12a,12b}$	(1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7)	-	$P_{7,7}$	960	$C_7$
Total				3571	

Table 3.5. Constructing a minimal nilpotent cover of A<sub>8</sub>

5

Label	element	power of	subgroup	number	structure
$Cl_1$	(1)	All	-	-	-
$Cl_2$	(1,2)(3,4)	Cl <sub>8</sub>	-	-	-
$Cl_3$	(1,2)(3,4)(5,6)(7,8)	$Cl_{10}$	-	-	-
$Cl_4$	(1,2,3)	Cl <sub>5</sub>	-	-	-
$Cl_5$	(1,2,3)(4,5)(6,7)	Cl <sub>9</sub>	-	-	-
$Cl_6$	(1,2,3)(4,5,6)	$Cl_{14}$	-	-	-
$Cl_7$	(1,2,3)(4,5,6)(7,8,9)	<i>Cl</i> <sub>16</sub>	-	-	
Cl <sub>8</sub>	(1,2,3,4)(5,6)	Cl <sub>9</sub>	-	-	-
$Cl_9$	(1,2,3,4)(5,6,7)(8,9)	-	$P_{2},6 \times P_{3},3$	3780	D8 × C3
$Cl_{10}$	(1,2,3,4)(5,6,7,8)	-	-	?	-
$Cl_{11}$	(1,2,3,4,5)	<i>Cl</i> <sub>12</sub>	-	-	-
$Cl_{12}$	(1,2,3,4,5)(6,7)(8,9)	-	$P_{5}, 5 \times P_{2}, 4$	756	C5 × C2 × C2
Cl13a,13b	(1,2,3,4,5)(6,7,8)	-	$P_{5}, 5 \times P_{3}, 3$	3024	C5 × C3
$Cl_{14}$	(1,2,3,4,5,6)(7,8)	-	<i>C</i> <sub>6</sub>	15120	<i>C</i> <sub>6</sub>
$Cl_{15}$	(1,2,3,4,5,6,7)	-	P7,7	4320	C <sub>7</sub>
Cl16a,16b	(1,2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9)	-	P3,9	1120	C3 ≀ C3
Total				28120+?	

Table 3.6. Constructing a minimal nilpotent cover of A9

#### 4. Final remark

It is interesting to compare the values given in Table 3.1 with Sequence A218964 of [OEI25] which enumerates the total number of maximal nilpotent subgroups of the alternating groups  $A_n$ . Up to n = 7, the two sequences coincide.

Note that the just-cited sequence from [OEI25] is a corrected version of a sequence first appearing in [NP13].

#### References

[GKS22] N. Gill, N. A. Kimeu, and I. Short, *Nilpotent covers of symmetric and alternating groups*, Bull. Belg. Math. Soc. - Simon Stevin **29** (2022), no. 2, 249–266.

[NP13] L. Naughton and G. Pfeiffer, Integer sequences realized by the subgroup pattern of the symmetric group., J. Integer Seq. 16 (2013), no. 5, article 13.5.8, 23 (English).

[OEI25] OEIS Foundation Inc., The On-Line Encyclopedia of Integer Sequences, 2025, Published electronically at http://oeis.org.